

**MINUTES**  
**ALAMEDA COUNTY PARKS, RECREATION AND HISTORICAL**  
**COMMISSION**

**Thursday, May 1, 2008**  
**East Bay Regional Park District,**  
**2950 Peralta Oaks Court, Oakland, CA**  
**(Approved June 5, 2008)**

**I. Call to Order – Roll Call**

The meeting was called to order at 3:40 p.m. by Commissioner Allen, Chair.

Commissioners Present:

Annalee Allen  
Al Minard  
James Loughran  
David Sadoff  
Julie Machado  
Harry Francis (arrived late)  
MaryAnn McMillan  
Dennis Waespi

Staff Present:

Angela Robinson-Pinõn  
Nilma Singh

Commissioners Excused:

Marie Cronin  
Stephen Sanger  
David Tam

Commissioners Absent:

Ellen Wyrick-Parkinson

Guests:

Lucia & Manuel Soares, property owner of  
22319 Meekland Avenue, Hayward  
Robert Souza, CV Forum

**I. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**

- II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES** – Minutes of April 3 ~ Commissioner Machado made a correction on Page 3, VI.A, the last sentence to read: “.....that the Commission may still request a full cultural resource survey.”; and Commissioner Minard made a spelling correction (Tim Swenson) under the Commissioner Report. Commissioner Waespi made the motion to approve the amended Minutes and Commissioner McMillan seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

Commissioner Francis arrived.

- III. OPEN PUBLIC FORUM - Any member of the public may address the Commission on a matter not on the regular agenda. No discussion or action may be taken on these items.**  
*None.*

- IV. CHAIR and STAFF REPORT(S):** *These items include information and discussion by the Commission:*

**A. CHAIR REPORT** – The Chair announced that Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson will be awarded the Oakland’s ‘Mother of the Year’ Award on May 10<sup>th</sup> at the Rose Garden; BAHA is holding a House Tour this Sunday, May 4<sup>th</sup>; submitted a newspaper article on the facelift of the Piedmont Avenue train station remnant and its history; and noted that May is the Preservation Month.

**B. STAFF REPORT** – Staff distributed a Correspondence Folder which included City of Livermore Historic Preservation Commission May 1<sup>st</sup> Agenda; a postcard from City of Dublin regarding the Intent to Adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration on their Historic Park Master Plan; and applications for the Design Review Committee. The Planning Department is working on the Illustrated Design Guidelines and Draft Development Standards and is looking for volunteers. She had attended the 2-day California Preservation Foundation Historic Preservation Conference, and noted that the next one is in Palm Springs; and had also attended, along with Commissioner Minard, the Historic Preservation Works on April 9<sup>th</sup>, sponsored by Redwood City and State Historic Preservation Office. Commissioner Minard added that City of San Francisco has Historical Preservation Guidelines for different City Districts which he will email the Commission.

**V. OLD BUSINESS** – *All old business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

**A. 22319 Meekland Avenue – The Commission will discuss a proposed demolition. The Commission will decide whether to support or to oppose the demolition request.** Ms. Robinson-Pinõn presented the staff report. Lucia Soares, property owner, explained and submitted copies of the Chain of Title and Deeds pointing out that although their address (the house #) had not changed, the Surveyor’s marks remained the same. She had also checked unsuccessfully for any references to these owners in the following books, ‘The Early Hayward History’ and ‘The Early San Lorenzo History’; instead had found only references to the Meek Estate. The description of their property does include the words ‘Meek Estate Orchards’. She also introduced some old photographs of her parents in front of Meek Estate and their family store located opposite the library in 1920. They are aware of the significance of historical preservation, appreciate history and have renovated their old Victorian house built in 1910. Commissioner Francis commended their efforts and time spent. Commissioner McMillan noted that only half of the house has adobe and asked if there is an explanation. Ms. Soares replied no and Mr. Soares confirmed that only one and a half walls are adobe while the other two and half are stucco. Commissioner Minard thought the construction style of the dwelling indicates perhaps a worker’s cabin, and as such, expressed concerns regarding its demolition even though it may not be architecturally significant. Commissioner Machado noted that the Consultants had placed this property on the List, the importance of adobe to local history and that the structure lacks integrity. She asked if a different decision will ‘bind’ the Commission. Staff explained the different levels of integrity noting the lack of such a level on the DPR--perhaps only a local interest. And a different decision will not be binding.

Commissioner Sadoff said that he also appreciated their work. The Consultant does list the property as a local historical significance. Since the Ordinance is incomplete, he expressed precedent setting concerns. If approved, he asked if the Applicants will consider mitigation measures such as pictures and/or a plaque to provide a record. The Chair suggested relocating the structure. Ms. Soares said she was willing to donate the structure but requested advice/help as the structure is disintegrating. Commissioner McMillan agreed that the structure lacks integrity and, as such, recommended filing pictures with the Hayward Area Historical Society and building a plaque on the side using some of the adobe bricks. Commissioner Minard said that although he would like to save the structure, he recommended that the tiles be used as a roof to protect the adobe wall. The Chair also recommended that the Applicants contact the Hayward Area Historical Society. *Commissioner Loughran made the motion in support of the demolition together with the above discussed mitigation measures: photographs submitted to Hayward Area Historical Society; and move portion of the wall to the side of the property with tiles on top for protection of the adobe with a pictured plaque (recommendations on the design and wording of the plaque are to be obtained from the Hayward Area Historical*

*Society.. Commissioner Waespi seconded. Commissioner Francis recommended that the wall with the plaque be readily accessible to the public. Motion carried unanimously. The Chair requested for photographs upon completion of the project.*

In response to the applicant's request for a copy of the Commission Minutes, staff explained that the Minutes will be approved at the next meeting and subsequently posted on our website.

**B. Highland Hospital Update – The Commission will discuss the draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR).** The Chair stated that although she had submitted a letter as an individual, she had noted the lack of any reference to this Commission; she had made copies of photographs contained in the Tribune files which will be submitted in the public record; she was also able to locate a copy of the Dedication; and noted the response letter from State Office of Historical Preservation requesting a re-circulation. She felt that the Auditorium should not be demolished and perhaps a history display would be appropriate. Commissioner Minard expressed concerns that this Commission has not had this matter as an 'action item' and did not support a demolition of a building for parking purposes. Commissioner Machado asked if a Commission letter can be submitted and the Chair replied that the deadline has passed. Staff explained that although the deadline has passed, any correspondence received now will not be included in the DEIR but will be taken into consideration in some form. She could also request that the Project Planner, Bruce Jensen, attend a Commission meeting at the release of the FEIR. *Commissioner McMillan made a motion for a letter in support of the comments made by the following: OHA, Chair Allen and SHIPPO; and the lack of any reference to this Commission in the DEIR. Commissioner Machado seconded. Motion carried unanimously. Commissioner McMillan will draft a letter for Commissioner Francis, the Vice-Chair's signature.* Commissioner Minard re-iterated his concerns regarding Brown Act and agendaizing such items as 'Action' items. Commissioner Francis agreed. Staff pointed out that a Subcommittee had been formed to review the DEIR. The Chair explained that after the Subcommittee had been formed, the matter had not been agendaized for action and, as such, no formal action was taken. She had discussed the matter under the Chair's Report at the last meeting and had submitted her letter. Commissioner Machado re-stated her concerns that this Commission is being 'by-passed'. A discussion ensued regarding project application and the Demolition Permit processes.

**C. Measure AA Subcommittee Update – The subcommittee will report their findings, and the Commissioners will be asked for their comments.** Commissioner Waespi distributed copies of the Proposed Regional Park Bond Measure Extension and Draft Project List and explained the Measure, benefits, allocation of funds. *He made a motion to endorse this Measure. Commissioner Francis seconded it. Motion carried unanimously.* Commissioner Minard expressed concerns regarding the demolition of historical buildings located in the parks. *Commissioner Francis amended his motion to include urging the District to consider preservation of historical park buildings with a copy to the Board of Supervisors.* He urged all to attend the meeting in Dublin tonight (May 1<sup>st</sup>) and will draft a letter for the Chair's signature.

**NEW BUSINESS** – *All new business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

Commissioner Minard requested clarification regarding the Olivina Gate adding that although the State required renovations per Secretary of Interiors' standards, the Consultant, Carey & Co and the State have declared the Gate to be historically insignificant. The DPR does not even indicate the Gate as 'locally significant'. At his request, the matter will be agendaized for

discussion/clarification at the next meeting. Staff further explained that the information was included in the Commission package as a follow-up at the request of City of Livermore.

**A. Mills Act – The Commission will discuss the establishment of a Mills Act Program.** The Chair requested that this matter be continued to the next meeting as she did not have the information on City of Oakland’s Mills Act Pilot Program. Commissioner Minard reported that credit is based on the rental rate of equivalent properties, approximately \$2,000 yearly. Staff explained the Historical Property Valuation Examples included in the Commission package. There are three methods of implementing the Act: 1) the BOS to approve a Mills Act Program and direct the Assessors’ Office for implementation; 2) approve a Mills Act Ordinance; and 3) incorporate the program with the Preservation Ordinance. Commissioner Waespi recommended that a representative from the Assessor’s Office attend a future Commission meeting to discuss examples and/or calculations. Commissioner Sadoff agreed adding that he would like to have concrete numbers for the public instead of a “to do list”. Staff also pointed out that the Act will be beneficial to new owners only because of Prop 13. Commissioner Machado said she would like the Act to be part of the Preservation Ordinance. *Commissioner Minard made the motion in support of this option (be part of the Preservation Ordinance) and Commissioner Machado seconded.* The Chair, although in favor of the motion, re-iterated her request for a continuance for an extensive discussion. *Motion carried unanimously.*

**B. State Historic Preservation Officer – The Commission will discuss extending an invitation to the State Historic Preservation Officer to attend a PRHC workshop or meeting.** Commissioner Machado said that she would like to extend an invitation to the Planning Commissioners also. Commissioner Minard requested that a check be made with SHIPO regarding their availability and agreed to do so. *The matter was continued, to be agendized for the June meeting.*

**C. Title Search and Demolition forms – continued to the next agenda.**

Staff distributed copies of the DPR on the Mohr-Fry estate, copies of the Commission comments from April 4<sup>th</sup> meeting and the Draft Ordinance.

**VIII. COMMISSIONER REPORTS – Commissioners will report on areas of concern and/or informational items concerning parks, recreation and historical preservation issues within the supervisory districts they serve.**

**A. District 1: Haggerty -** Commissioner Minard reported that he had attended the designation of Highway 84 through Niles Canyon as Scenic Highway, and also the dedication of the Leal Water Tank House, Ardenwood, restored by the Rotary Club which is open daily. The Rotary has restored a creekside walk in Mission San Jose.

**B. District 2: Steele -** Commissioner Francis announced that the skateboard project is at the Board, scheduled to begin at the end of the school year; and an organization called ‘Questers’ would like to get involved with historical preservation and is willing to do research work, if the Commission was interested. The Chair requested details at the next meeting.

Commissioner Machado reported that Hayward Area Historical Society held their annual historical awards and was pleased that Bancheros, The Cobblers...etc were recognized.

**C. District 3: Lai-Bitker - *None*.**

**D. District 4: Miley -** Commissioners Allen announced that the Oakland Heritage Alliance will be holding their awards night on Thursday, May 8<sup>th</sup> and reminded the Commission of Berkeley House tour on Sunday, May 4<sup>th</sup>.

**E. District 5: Carson - *None*.**

**IX. ADMINISTRATIVE**

**A. Agenda Items for future meetings**

**X. ADJOURNMENT:** There being no other business, Commissioner McMillan made the motion to adjourn and Commissioner Minard seconded. Meeting was adjourned at 5:50 pm.