

**MINUTES**  
**ALAMEDA COUNTY PARKS, RECREATION AND HISTORICAL**  
**COMMISSION**

**Thursday, December 6, 2007**

**Alameda County Planning Department Conference Room**

**224 W. Winton Avenue, Room 111, Hayward, CA 94544**

**(Approved January 3, 2008)**

**I. Call to Order – Roll Call**

The meeting was called to order at 3:40 p.m. by Commissioner Sanger, Chair.

Commissioners Present:

Al Minard (arrived late)  
Dennis Waespi  
James Loughran  
David Sadoff  
David Tam (arrived late)  
Harry Francis  
MaryAnn McMillan  
Steven Sanger

Staff Present:

Angela Robinson-Pinõn  
Nilma Singh

Commissioners Excused:

Julie Machado  
Marie Cronin  
Ellen Wyrick-Parkinson  
Annalee Allen

Guests:

Vince Horpel, Row Chabot  
John Vlahos, Row Chabot  
Dan Garnhart, Prop. owner at 1129-1143 Grove Way  
Y. T. Wong, Bayview Heights Project  
Kelly O’Brian, 21019 Baker Road Project  
Bob Swanson, Supervisor Miley’s Office  
Robert Souza, CV Forum  
M. Morrison, 21019 Baker Road Project  
David and John Langon, Owner/Developer, 21019  
Baker Road Project

**II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES** – Minutes of September 6 and November 1 meetings. September 6<sup>th</sup> Minutes were continued awaiting comments from Commissioner Allen. The following corrections were made to the November 1<sup>st</sup> Minutes: the Chair’s and Commissioner Cronin’s absence to be reflected as ‘Excused’; page 1, Open Forum – ‘Marie Township’ to be replaced with Murray Township; page 2, V #A be amended to read: The Commission concurred with Commissioner Sadoff’s recommendation to delete one of the San Miguel properties on page 9 and include a DPR for 4529 Malabar Avenue on page 7. Commissioner Sadoff made the motion to approve the amended November 1<sup>st</sup> Minutes and Commissioner Waespi seconded with the Chair abstaining.

**III. OPEN PUBLIC FORUM** - Any member of the public may address the Commission on a matter not on the regular agenda. No discussion or action may be taken on these items. *No one requested to be heard under Open Forum.*

**IV. CHAIR and STAFF REPORT(S):** *These items include information and discussion by the Commission:*

**A. CHAIR REPORT** – *None.*

- B. **STAFF REPORT** – *Staff will provide data on the number of demolition permits issued by the Public Works Agency Building Inspection Division.* Ms. Robinson-Pinõn presented the Demolition Report noting that the numbers do not represent historical properties. In response to the Chair, she indicated that she was unsure which of the demolitions were for properties over 50 years in age, but she could look into it and provide the information at the next meeting.

V. **OLD BUSINESS** – *All old business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

- A. **Update on the Status of Row Chabot** – Mr. Horpel expressed gratitude for the Commission’s involvement and the Park District has been more responsive as a result. They had a meeting with the District last month and a design meeting has been scheduled on Tuesday, December 11<sup>th</sup>, 1-3 p.m., Lake Chabot Nike Room. Mr Horpel requested the Commission’s attendance, if possible, especially Commissioners representing Supervisors Miley and Lai Bitker’s districts. The feasibility study will be completed by the end of January and the construction timeline is Spring, 2008. Mr. Vlahos added that a Castro Valley High School student is extremely interested in this program along with others.

Commissioner Minard arrived.

- B. **Update on the Status of 278 Hampton Road** – Ms. Robinson-Pinõn presented the staff report and at the request of the Chair, will provide the name of the project architect at the next meeting.

VI. **NEW BUSINESS** – *All new business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

- A. **Skate Park in Castro Valley** – *The Commission will discuss writing a letter of support for this project.* Commissioner Francis felt that a letter of support was not necessary at this time as the matter is on the HARD Board agenda on Monday, December 10<sup>th</sup>. Larry Lepore, Park Superintendent, HARD, agreed adding that the School District is in agreement.

- B. **21019 Baker Street** – *The Commission will review a demolition request.* Staff presented the staff report and introduced the project Planner, Howard Lee. In response to Commissioner Sadoff, Mr. Lee indicated that a historical assessment has not been completed yet but the Applicant will decide after today’s meeting.

David Langon, applicant, explained that although a historical assessment has not been completed, a structural engineer has completed the structural integrity inspection confirming that the building is unsafe and needs to be demolished. Since the Ordinance has not been approved, he will not consider his property as being on a official list. Demolished materials will be used as much as possible. The previous owners were also interviewed and the history (documentations) of the property reviewed. Mr. Langon described these in detail and submitted a current picture of the property/building. Commissioner Sadoff said that he would like to see some documentation. Mr. Langon added that he was willing to install a historical plaque. The integrity of the church has been preserved from one location to another. *Commissioner Minard felt that the building is historical by age and perhaps negative*

*history. He made the motion that a historical assessment be completed. Commissioner Sadoff seconded. Commissioner McMillan added that she had driven past the property and thought that photographs should be taken before any demolition.*

A neighbor pointed out that she had checked at the new church location and no one was aware of the old church, the Lady of Grace. There is no connection.

Mr. Langon re-iterated that aside from whether or not there is historical significance, the building is structurally unsafe.

Commissioner Waespi complimented the Langon Group on using Green Building materials and pursuing LEED certification. Mr. Swanson stated that a fax from Doris Marciel has been faxed to staff. *Motion for the applicant to complete a historical assessment was carried unanimously.*

- C. 1129 Grove Way – *The Commission will comment on a proposed re-zoning.*** Staff presented the staff report. Dan Garnhart, applicant/owner, said his goal is to fix the property and further outlined the project. Commissioner Minard stated that he had driven by the property and felt that the exterior is very historical-looking and perhaps could qualify as a historical resource. *Commissioner McMillan made the motion that staff will require a historical assessment on the property and Commissioner Sadoff seconded. Motion carried unanimously.*

Commissioner Tam arrived at 4:52 p.m.

- D. 22538 Bavview Avenue – *The Commission will review a demolition request.*** The Chair noted that one of the Commissioners is concerned with archeological elements and, as such, requested that the Permit requirement be that an archeologist be present on site during demolition. Commissioner Minard said he was disappointed in the historical report. The existence of the creek could mean archeological finds. To be eligible for any Register, only one criteria needs to be filled. At the request of Commissioner Sadoff, staff will check if a peer review could be requested.

Mr. Wong, Applicant, pointed out that at the request of the project Planner, a consultant was hired due to the age of the home. The Alameda County Commission will hear this item on December 17<sup>th</sup>. He asked if they could do something in preparation of this hearing. Minard said he took photographs and felt that the rear structure could be removed without any damage to the original integrity and the tank house. Since there is a lot of history on site, he requested a detailed title search to confirm the significance of the ‘Smith and Atherton Families’; and archeological report. Commissioner Sadoff added that a more focused report, a peer review, be requested. Commissioner McMillan disagreed with the first sentence on page 2 regarding the granting of a portion of the Rancho San Lorenzo to Guillermo Castro in 1841. Commissioner Minard made the motion that the Commission recommends approval of the project, peer review of the title history search/peer review and an archeologist be present during demolition. Ms. Greene, staff planner, expressed concern that the peer review might not be ready prior to the Planning Commission action on December 17<sup>th</sup>. In response the Chair indicated that the Commission recommends that the Planning Commission continue the matter to allow time for a peer review; approve with a peer review requirement or deny without a peer review. *Motion carried unanimously.*

- E. 9355 Patterson Road** – *The Commission will discuss a request for an addition to list of properties subject to the Historic Preservation Ordinance.* Staff presented the staff report. The Chair recommended that the matter be referred to Carey & Company for assessment and recommendation to be included on the list. *The Commission agreed unanimously.*

Commissioner McMillan recommended adding another barn to the Secondary List: 4821 Crow Canyon Road, Castro Valley. Motion for the addition carried unanimously.

- F. Election of 2008 Chair and Vice Chair** – *The Commission will consider nominees for these positions.* Commissioner McMillan, on behalf of the Subcommittee, submitted nominations for the new Chair, Commissioner Allen and Vice-Chair, Commissioner Francis. Commissioner Minard made the motion to accept the recommendations and have the matter agendaized for action at the next meeting. Commissioner Waespi seconded. Motion carried unanimously. Chair Sanger thanked the Commission for the opportunity to serve as the Chair and Vice-Chair Sadoff for his work. Commissioner Waespi thanked the Chair for his work.

- VIII. COMMISSIONER REPORTS** – Commissioner Waespi made the motion to continue Reports to the next meeting and Commissioner Sadoff seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

**IX. ADMINISTRATIVE**

- A. Agenda Items for future meetings** – Commissioner Francis pointed out that Castro Valley has very few historical structures and, as such, he felt that there is a need to look at all applications that are submitted.

Vice-Chair Sadoff thanked staff for the well organized Commission package.

Commissioner Tam announced his unavailability for the evening workshop.

Commissioner McMillan urged the Commissioners to request their Supervisors for new Commission appointees. The Chair recommended agendaizing the matter with perhaps a letter from the new Chair to the Board of Supervisors requesting new appointees.

- X. ADJOURNMENT:** There being no other business, meeting was adjourned at 5:25 pm.