

MINUTES
ALAMEDA COUNTY PARKS, RECREATION AND HISTORICAL
COMMISSION

Thursday, March 4, 2010
East Bay Regional Park District,
2950 Peralta Oaks Court, Oakland, CA
(Approved July 12, 2010)

I. Call to Order – Roll Call

The meeting was called to order at 3:40 p.m. by Commissioner McMillan, Acting Chair.

Commissioners Present:

Annalee Allen
Marie Cronin
James Loughran
MaryAnn McMillan
David Tam
Harry Francis
Audree Jones-Taylor

Commissioners Excused:

David Sadoff
Stephen Sanger
Al Minard
Ellen Wyrick-Parkinson
Samuel Kang

Guests:

Staff Present:

Liz McElligott
Angela Robinson-Piñon
Nilma Singh

1. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – *Commissioner Allen made the motion to approve the February 4th Minutes as submitted and Commissioner Francis seconded. Motion carried unanimously.*

III. OPEN PUBLIC FORUM - Any member of the public may address the Commission on a matter not on the regular agenda. No discussion or action may be taken on these items. *None.*

IV. CHAIR and STAFF REPORT(S): *These items include information and discussion by the Commission:*

A. CHAIR REPORT – Commissioner McMillan announced the new Commissioner Jones-Taylor who introduced herself.

B. STAFF REPORT – *None*

V. OLD BUSINESS – *All old business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

A. Dry Creek Cottage- *The Commission will discuss the potential impacts of the proposed Masonic Homes Development on the Dry Creek Cottage.*

Staff announced that the project is on hold indefinitely. A discussion followed regarding the project, EIR availability, preservation of open space and submission of comments. Commissioner Francis

said that he would like to be notified of any new project proposals in future. Staff explained that although a letter could be submitted, this Commission is on the EIR mailing list and should be notified of action on this project. Ms. McElligott added that any new project would require a new EIR.

B. Meek Estate- *The Commission will hear an update on plans for the West Terrace.*

Ms. Robinson-Piñon presented the staff report.

John Gouveia, Business Manager, H.A.R.D., provided background information. A new architectural firm, RRM Design Group, has been hired to provide different designs based on the suggestions received at the November community meeting. Community meetings will follow for input with a referral to this Commission. Commissioner Francis announced that he had attended the community meeting which was well attended and many good suggestions were submitted. In response to Commissioner Loughran, Mr. Gouveia said that he did not have a timeframe but will report back.

A discussion followed regarding the proposed site for the new Cherryland Community Center. One of the Commissioners inquired about the potential removal of trees on the property and Jaimie Benson, Redevelopment Agency, confirmed that the trees have not been removed.

C. 20265 Mission Blvd. - *The Commission will discuss a proposed demolition of a structure over 50 years old.*

Ms. Robinson-Piñon provided clarification between the two addresses as reflected on the agenda and staff report, 20265 Mission Blvd and 20095 Mission Blvd as stated in the Redevelopment report. Both numbers are for the same property -- Page & Turnbull report reflects 20265; Carey & Co and Redevelopment reports reflect 20095.

Jaimie Benson, Redevelopment Agency, presented the staff report. Since Carey & Company's findings indicated that the property has historical significance and Page & Turnbull report indicated no historical significance, Redevelopment Agency requested a peer review analysis from Garavaglia Architecture, Inc. who concurred with Page & Turnbull that there is no architectural significance. In response to Commissioners Francis and Cronin, Ms. Benson provided previous ownership details, pointed out the location of all the parcels, and confirmed that the County currently owns the property but will eventually sell to a developer. Commissioner Allen asked if any material will be salvaged. Ms. Benson replied yes, deconstructed, recycled and/or resold. In reference to Page & Turnbull report, Commissioner McMillan listed the following corrections: DeSoto Rancho was incorrect (page 5) as it was owned by Barbara and Francisco Soto and known as San Lorenzito Rancho; Barbara was Don Guillermo's sister and not his daughter; the Lewelling Family had only 119 acres (page 5) and he moved to Alameda County, Fruitvale, in 1954 and not 1953; it was not Henderson's descendants that also bought land but John; Eli was his son, not grandson; and on page 7, first sentence of the second paragraph, San Leandro be replaced with San Lorenzo. Ms. Benson said she will request a corrected report from Page & Turnbull. Commissioner Francis expressed concern on the number of errors and that there could be other reports with many errors also. Commissioner McMillan added that perhaps the location of the areas, i.e. San Lorenzo, Cherryland...etc should be defined, the identity of the architect for the PG & E substation researched and asked for the qualifications for Garavaglia Architecture, Inc and the definition of the word 'significant' used in their report. Ms. Benson replied that she was not aware of their specific qualifications but they are familiar with such work and have completed many other reports; and the word 'significant' meant character defining elements and stated some examples. Commissioner Cronin felt that no action could be taken until there is a corrected report. Ms. Benson indicated that the above corrections will be made available to

all three companies for future reference and an updated report requested from Page & Turnbull. Commissioner Allen asked if the corrected report could include an analysis on the PG & E substations within the County, not to slow down the project but for future reference and stated her support for deconstruction. Commissioner Francis asked if there is any process that allows public organizations to buy such properties. Ms. Benson replied yes and they do notify communities and other agencies. The two options would be to place the item on next month's agenda with a new updated report or an action today and to provide staff with a corrected copy when available. Commissioner Allen made the motion to include a request that the errors be corrected and presented at the next meeting with an intention to approve the demolition. The Commission agreed to an approval motion. *Commissioner Allen withdrew her initial motion and made a substitute motion to accept the Page & Turnbull report with the above corrections of facts and allow building deconstruction. Commissioner Cronin made a friendly amendment to include 'within 30 days'. Commissioner Loughran seconded and the motion carried unanimously.*

VI. NEW BUSINESS – *All new business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

A. 1048 Grant Avenue- *The Commission will hear about a proposed project at 1048 Grant Avenue.*

Staff presented the staff report adding that she has a large map for review.

Norman Sanchez, project architect, provided background information. Tom Clements has been the property owner for over 20 years, operates his business from this site, has added an All Wars Memorial that is open to the public, and the facility is informally used by different neighborhood groups. The intent is to change the residence features (full kitchen and formal dining room) into a business layout and to provide better access, parking and provide access to the existing restroom. The parking has been oriented such as to provide an accommodating entrance, remove evidence of the older addition to be consistent to the original style and up-date the rear entrance. This matter will be heard by the Planning Commission on April 15th. Although no changes have been made to the maps as reflected in the drawings included in the Commission package, Mr. Sanchez explained that he has available a larger set of maps which includes tabulations (square footage...etc). Commissioner McMillan pointed out that if the additions are made to be consistent to the existing style, then the building would not be eligible for the State Register. In response, Commissioner Allen pointed out the 4th paragraph on page 17 of 42 of the Initial Study (IS). Commissioner McMillan also noted that the IS does not mention the Little League Park which was the orchard of the original Heidi family, asked if there is a well on the property, if there will be an impact on the Brood House and the reason for the stairs on the west side. In response, Mr. Sanchez pointed out that the park is mentioned in the historical report; he was not sure of a well although there is a water tower on the west side which will remain; and the Brood House will also remain (page A2 of the Plan), and the staircase entry on the west is a convenience and will also provide access from the adjacent property which is also owned by Mr. Clements. Commissioner Allen asked for the possibility of a historical plaque. Mr. Sanchez replied that Mr. Clements has the intention to register the building but could also consider a plaque. Commissioner McMillan also pointed out the reference to the 1981 General Plan for the Central Metropolitan Eden & Washington Planning Units. Ms. McElligott explained that this is the current Plan and the new Eden Plan has not been approved yet (on the March 30th BOS agenda) and this new Plan will not change any designations in this area. Staff added that the San Lorenzo Specific Plan covers only the main commercial areas. In response to Commissioner Cronin, Mr. Sanchez explained that the upper level will remain as a storage area as it is structurally unsafe to convert to habitable space. *Commissioner Loughran made a motion to accept the proposal as submitted and Commissioner Francis seconded. Motion carried unanimously.*

B. St. John's Church- *The Commission will discuss the impact of road widening of East Lewelling Blvd. on the property.*

Ms. Robinson-Piñon presented the staff report noting that this is an informational item only.

VII. COMMISSIONER REPORTS – *Commissioners will report on areas of concern and/or informational items concerning parks, recreation and historical preservation issues within the supervisory districts they serve.*

A. District 1: Haggerty – *No report.*

B. District 2: Steele - *No report.*

C. District 3: Lai-Bitker - Commissioner Loughran distributed discount admission cards for the Oakland Aviation Museum, provided by Pamela Buckingham, Manager, Oakland Airport Air Museum.

D. District 4: Miley - Commissioners Allen reported that the Oakland City Council will propose, under the budget year 2010-2011, to cease operational funding, approximately \$129,000, for the Peralta Hacienda Historical Park. She also urged the Commission to tour the historical house as all exhibits are on display now. Commissioner Jones-Taylor added that the House is open Monday through Saturday.

E. District 5: Carson – Commissioner Tam announced that he is now renting in a 95-year old building in Berkeley; the nonprofit group formed to preserve Iceland has not been able to raise the \$6m acquisition financing; and the East Bay Express had an article on the first year up-date of Measure WW.

VII. ADMINISTRATIVE

A. Agenda Items for future meetings

The Commission discussed the status of the Ordinance and possible future meeting locations such as the Peralta Hacienda Historical House and Highland Hospital. Commissioner Loughran asked if staff has received information on the Bayside Trail, a section of which was just completed in Richmond-San Rafael Bridge area. If not, he would like a copy and requested agendaizing the matter for the next meeting. Commissioner Allen recommended a presentation by one of the community groups. Staff noted a recent newspaper article on access to the trail that the County had purchased an easement for and doing a boat launch ramp as part of the Martin Luther King Jr. Shoreline.

X. ADJOURNMENT: *There being no other business, Commissioner Loughran made the motion to adjourn and Commissioner Francis seconded. Meeting was adjourned at 5:35 pm.*