

MINUTES
ALAMEDA COUNTY PARKS, RECREATION AND HISTORICAL
COMMISSION

Thursday, March 5, 2009
East Bay Regional Park District,
2950 Peralta Oaks Court, Oakland, CA

I. Call to Order – Roll Call

The meeting was called to order at 3:40 p.m. by Commissioner Minard, Chair.

Commissioners Present:

Annalee Allen
Al Minard
James Loughran
David Sadoff
David Tam
Harry Francis
Ellen Wyrick-Parkinson
MaryAnn McMillan

Commissioners Excused:

Marie Cronin
Dennis Waespi

Commissioners Absent:

Stephen Sanger

Guests:

Staff Present:

Liz McElligott
Angela Robinson-Piñon

II. CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Commissioner Allen, in reference to January 8th Minutes, made a correction on page 5, the correct spelling of Julia Morgan’s name. *Commissioner Sadoff made the motion to approve the January 8th Minutes as corrected and Commissioner McMillan seconded. Motion carried unanimously.*

Commissioner Allen made the motion to approve the February 5th Minutes as submitted and Commissioner Sadoff seconded. Motion carried unanimously.

IV. OPEN PUBLIC FORUM - Any member of the public may address the Commission on a matter not on the regular agenda. No discussion or action may be taken on these items. *None.*

V. CHAIR and STAFF REPORT(S): *These items include information and discussion by the Commission:*

A. **CHAIR REPORT** – *None*

B. **STAFF REPORT** – *None*

VI. OLD BUSINESS – *All old business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

A. **20853 Wilbeam Avenue** – *The Commission will discuss a proposed demolition.*

Ms. Robinson-Piñon read the staff report and introduced Marita Hawryluk representing Redevelopment Agency. She had presented this project to this Commission last November

and at the Commission's recommendation, a historical architectural study has been completed, an Initial Study prepared and a Negative Declaration (Neg. Dec.) filed. Although built in the 1930's, alterations have comprised the historical integrity of the building. A title search did not reveal any significant residents at this location also. She distributed related photographs. In response to the Chair, Ms. Hawryluk explained that Redevelopment Agency is required to file a Housing Relocation Plan and a Housing Replacement Plan, both approved by the Board of Supervisors; and low-income/affordable housing replacement. Staff added that she could provide Housing Element figures including HUD, median income, household sizes/percentages, projected cost of housing for purchase/rent...etc. Commissioner McMillan asked if photographs had been taken and if they were submitted to Hayward Area Historical Society. Ms. Hawryluk replied yes, photographs were taken and were attached to the Neg. Dec., and she was willing to file them with the Society. Commissioner Sadoff thanked for the follow-up and concurred with the Findings of the report. *He made the motion to endorse the findings of the historical review and the Mitigated Neg. Dec. and Commissioner Francis seconded. Motion carried unanimously.*

B. Nomination of a Potentially Historic Resource – *The Commission will consider whether or not to support the nomination of 1923 Pullman Railroad car for the California Register.*

Commissioner Loughran stated that Mr. Lantry had provided an outstanding presentation at the last meeting and the Commission had been in support of the proposal. Mr. Lantry had requested a letter of support to be submitted to the State Office of Historic Preservation. He would be willing to make the motion if the Commission agreed. The Chair added that the documentation had errors, which was also recognized by staff of the State Office of Historic Preservation. Commissioner Loughran recommended tabling the matter for a month to allow time for edits to the documentation. Commissioner Allen asked for the types of information contained in the documentation. The Chair replied that it was mostly technical restoration information. Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson also suggested re-agendizing the matter next month and inviting Mr. Lantry. A discussion ensued. Commissioner Tam, although not sure if appropriate, suggested contacting the National Rail Historical Association and asked if there were any historical people associated with the car. Staff replied that the Mr. Lantry did not supply such information, and the car is eligible for recognition because it is the last existing, relatively intact car from that time period (1923). A discussion followed regarding the possibility of re-writing the documentation and by whom; lack of background information; and connection with Alameda County. Staff added that Mr. Lantry will be in town next week and would be available if there is an interest in a tour. Commissioner Loughran requested staff to advise him of the Commission's concerns. Commissioner Sadoff felt that the car would certainly be eligible and if properly presented, there should not be any issues. As such, he would support a properly worded motion stating the Commission's concern. Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson said that she would not endorse as there are many unanswered questions. *Commissioner McMillan made the motion that a letter be sent to the State Office of Historic Preservation in favor of the recognition of 1923 Pullman Car on the condition that the applicant clarify the application for historic preservation. Commissioner Tam seconded the motion. Motion carried with Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson abstaining.*

C. 694 Bartlett Avenue - *The Commission will discuss a proposed demolition.*

Ms. Robinson-Pinon presented the staff report adding that since the applicant submitted the Historic Assessment Report on Friday morning, a revised agenda was prepared. The report indicates that the property is not of any historical value. Commissioner Sadoff said he would like examples of the 'nearby properties' as reflected on page 4 of the report. The Chair felt that it was erroneous as he had visited the site and with a demolition, a historic resource with

distinct trees will be lost. He recommended that staff, when requesting such reports, consider assessors with five or more years of experience. Ms. McElligott replied that the evaluator Mr. Jay Claiborne has worked on previous projects before the County, and stated that he has more than the 5 years of experience requested by Commissioner Minard. The Commission discussed the proposed plan and the maps on pages 9 and 10. Commissioner Loughran recommended a month's continuance to allow additional project information. The Chair concurred adding that he would also like a representative to be available if there are no time constraints. Although unsure of the significance, Commissioner McMillan noted that Charles Hathaway (page 8, Figure 8) sold the property to Joseph B. Marlon, a County Supervisor from 1858 -1870. The Chair noted that this information is not in the report and Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson also expressed her concern regarding the lack of information on the replacement structure. *Commissioner Loughran made the motion to continue this matter to allow for the developer/owner to be available at the next meeting. Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson seconded. Motion carried unanimously.*

VII. NEW BUSINESS – *All new business will include information, discussion and/or action by the Commission.*

A. 6511 Alisal Street – *The Commission will discuss a proposed demolition.*

Ms. Robinson-Pinõn presented the staff report. The Chair said he had visited the site this morning. There are a few similar older homes remaining and he felt that it would be possible to bring the house to-date but was perhaps there was a lack of motivation. Precedent setting was another concern. He also noted that no representative was available. Commissioner Loughran made the motion for a continuance to allow staff to be available to answer questions. The Chair said that he would also like the applicant to be present. A discussion ensued regarding the size of the parcel and proposed dwelling, the decision-making body and the Zoning District. Although sharing development concerns, Commissioner Sadoff expressed concerns that perhaps the Commission was over-stepping bounds by looking at the land use. The Chair said he would like a historical resource analysis completed and Commissioner McMillan agreed. If saving the dwelling, Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson recommended a non-profit use and landscaping. Commissioner Loughran re-iterated that he would like staff and/or applicant be available at the next meeting with a presentation and detailed maps/graphics. *He made a motion for a continuance to allow for additional detailed information and the Chair added that he would like a historical survey completed. Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson seconded and the Motion carried unanimously.*

VIII. COMMISSIONER REPORTS – *Commissioners will report on areas of concern and/or informational items concerning parks, recreation and historical preservation issues within the supervisory districts they serve.*

A. District 1: Haggerty – Commissioner Minard stated that the project to replace an old Fremont cannery with a display board on Alameda Creek Walkway has been approved. He requested that the signage proposal along the Alameda Creek in Fremont be presented to this Commission for review. Ms. McElligott indicated that staff will look into this. He was also working with a group of residents and members of historical committees for additional restoration and display information on the Higuera Building kiosk; and was in the process of forming a committee to portray the Chinese workers' cabins at the Shin Park with the aid of the funds from the Chinese business community.

- B. District 2: Steele** - Commissioner Francis announced that there is an article regarding the skateboard park in the Castro Valley Forum which will be opening in April.

Commissioner McMillan reported that the San Lorenzo Heritage Society will be working with Hayward Area Historical Society to help refurbish the San Lorenzo Cemetery. A committee, Friends of the San Lorenzo Cemetery, will be formed to over-look the up-keep.

- C. District 3: Lai-Bitker** – No report.

- D. District 4: Miley** - Commissioner Allen stated that she had attended the opening of the Fox Theater adding that she along with Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson could organize a tour if the Commission was interested; distributed brochures regarding the City of Oakland Mills Act pilot program; City of Oakland will be holding a lecture followed by a reception to celebrate the 140th anniversary of the Golden Spike and the completion of the transcontinental railroad in May--details to follow; in reference to the Pullman car item, there is announcement in the newspaper for any surviving Pullman porters; and a “Happy Birthday” to Abraham Lincoln.

- E. District 5: Carson** - Commissioners Tam apologized for his ‘spotty attendance’ the last few months and hoped that the Commission was aware that the HARD Bond measure had passed last November; and noted Tuesday’s SF Chronicle article on SPRAWLDEF (plaintiff) and East Shore State Park.

VII. ADMINISTRATIVE

A. Agenda Items for future meetings – Commissioner Allen asked if the Commission will receive copies of the Eden Medical Center FEIR and asked an update on the Preservation Ordinance--if and when future meetings will be held. Staff replied yes to the FEIR and Ms. McElligott added that staff is working only part-time and is currently working on the Housing Element which has a June deadline. Work on the Ordinance could re-start in April when she returns full-time. Commissioner McMillan asked for an up-date on the historic survey. Staff replied that there is no funding for additional survey or significant survey revision and there is still a public interest. Commissioner Wyrick-Parkinson requested a progress report on outstanding projects from 2008 and a wish list for this year including a field trip wish list. Commissioner Sadoff requested copies of the relevant sections of the Castro Valley and Eden General Plans and staff added the Housing Element. Commissioner McMillan asked is Commissioner Cronin was still in the hospital. Staff indicated that she had hurt her hip and was in physical rehabilitation. Commissioner Allen announced the rehabilitation of other movie theaters in Alameda County: Paramount and Alameda Theater. In reference to future agenda items, Larry Lepore, HARD, will be available at the next meeting to discuss the Wedding Pavilion at Meek Estate. Staff reminded the Commissioners to complete the on-line Ethics Training and to submit the Economic Interest Form 700.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT - Please contact staff at 670-5400 if you are unable to attend or will be late to this meeting.

X. ADJOURNMENT: There being no other business, Commissioner Sadoff made the motion to adjourn and Commissioner McMillan seconded. Meeting was adjourned at 5:40 p.m.