

MINUTES OF MEETING
EAST COUNTY BOARD OF ZONING ADJUSTMENTS
NOVEMBER 18, 2010
(APPROVED DECEMBER 8, 2010)

The meeting was held at the hour of 1:30 p.m. in the City of Livermore Council Chambers, 3575 Pacific Avenue, Livermore.

FIELD TRIP:

MEMBERS PRESENT: Members Jon Harvey; Larry Gosselin, Chair, and Jim Goff

FIELD TRIP: The Boardmembers visited the following properties individually:

1. **BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT/EAST BAY RADIO CONTROLLERS, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00066** ~ Application to allow continued operation of an outdoor recreation facility (model airplane field) in an 'A' (Agricultural) District, located on Laughlin Road, east side, approximately 900 feet north of Northfront Road, unincorporated Livermore area of Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 099B-5501-001-10 and 99B-5501-002-05. **Staff Planner: Damien Curry**

2. **CROWN CASTLE/OSBORNE, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00037** ~ Application to allow continued operation of a cell site consisting of a 50-foot monopole and equipment area, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 1901 Isabel Avenue, west side, south of Vineyard Avenue, Livermore area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 904-0008-001-02. **Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper**

3. **VERIZON WIRELESS/SHEARER, PLN2010-00113** ~ Application to allow co-location of a Verizon cell site facility and to increase the monopole height from 50 to 66 feet to allow additional nine new panel antennas, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 1901 Isabel Avenue, west side, south of Vineyard Avenue, Livermore area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 904-0008-001-02. **Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper**

4. **VERIZON WIRELESS/CHAVIS, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00147** ~ Application to allow installation of nine 8-foot panel antennas, two dish antennas, equipment area and a screening element on an existing building, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 707 Country Club Circle, south side, approximately 75 feet east of Castlewood Drive, Pleasanton area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 946-4386-001-20. **Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper**

REGULAR MEETING: 1:30 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Members Jon Harvey; Larry Gosselin, Chair and Jim Goff.

OTHERS PRESENT: Jana Beatty, Senior Planner and Nilma Singh, Recording Secretary

There were approximately 12 people in the audience.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by the Chair at 1:35 p.m.

OPEN FORUM: Open forum is provided for any members of the public wishing to speak on an item not listed on the agenda. Each speaker is limited to three (3) minutes. *No one requested to be heard under open forum.*

ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE CHAIR: *The Chair announced that at the request of the Applicants, Regular Calendar items 6, 7 and 8, will be continued. Staff added that the request is for a review of the recommended Conditions of Approval with County Counsel. These items were moved to the Consent Calendar to be continued without discussion to the next meeting.*

NEIGHBORHOOD PRESERVATION AND ZONING ORDINANCE ABATEMENT: *None*

CONSENT CALENDAR:

1. **CROWN CASTLE/OSBORNE, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00037 ~** Application to allow continued operation of a cell site consisting of a 50-foot monopole and equipment area, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 1901 Isabel Avenue, west side, south of Vineyard Avenue, Livermore area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 904-0008-001-02.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper
2. **VERIZON WIRELESS/SHEARER, PLN2010-00113 ~** Application to allow co-location of a Verizon cell site facility and to increase the monopole height from 50 to 66 feet to allow additional nine new panel antennas, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 1901 Isabel Avenue, west side, south of Vineyard Avenue, Livermore area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 904-0008-001-02.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper
3. **VERIZON WIRELESS/CHAVIS, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00147 ~** Application to allow installation of nine 8-foot panel antennas, two dish antennas, equipment area and a screening element on an existing building, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 707 Country Club Circle, south side, approximately 75 feet east of Castlewood Drive, Pleasanton area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 946-4386-001-20.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper

All the above applications (#1-3) were moved from the Regular to the Consent Calendar at the request of the Applicants. Member Harvey arrived.

Member Goff made the motion to approve the Consent Calendar and Member Harvey seconded. Motion carried unanimously, 3/0.

REGULAR CALENDAR:

4. **BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT/EAST BAY RADIO CONTROLLERS, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00066 ~** Application to allow continued operation of an outdoor recreation facility (model airplane field) in an 'A' (Agricultural) District, located on Laughlin Road, east side, approximately 900 feet north of Northfront

Road, unincorporated Livermore area of Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 099B-5501-001-10 and 99B-5501-002-05. (*Continued from October 28, 2010*)
Staff Planner: Damien Curry

Ms. Beatty presented the staff report noting Condition #5 which has not been installed to-date and suggested a discussion to see if a fence is still necessary. In response to Member Harvey regarding the purpose of the fence, she explained that the Minutes do not reflect the reasons as to why the condition was included in the COAs.

Public testimony was called for. Ken Bussey explained that the adjacent property owner had requested the installation of a fence; per Planning Department, an agricultural fence consisted of T-bar and barbed wire and at the Department's request, obtained and submitted estimates to both the neighbor and Planning Department; the neighbor opted not to share the cost and per Planning Department, this attempt was sufficient, hence, the fence was not installed. Although this section, the southern side of the property, is not used, Mr. Bussey said he was willing to install T-bars and metal wire instead of barbed wire fencing. However, if the Board requires, he was also willing to install a fence at their cost. During events, temporary fences with additional T-bars and yellow 'Caution' tapes are installed. Beginning January, 2011, the facility will be completely an electrically-powered club and further described the reasons in detail--price of fuel and availability of lithium batteries. In response to the Chair, Mr. Bussey replied that he could not remember the reason for the fence.

Danelle Brady, 1665 Bridle Path Court, stated her support for the facility.

Public testimony was closed. In response to Member Harvey, staff stated support for the deletion of Condition #5. The original request was made by the adjacent neighbor and since notification was provided of this hearing, the neighbor is not available nor has he submitted a written request. *Member Harvey made the motion for an approval subject to the recommended conditions with the deletion of Condition #5 and Member Goff seconded. Motion carried unanimously, 3/0.*

5. **CROWN CASTLE/OSBORNE, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00037** ~ Application to allow continued operation of a cell site consisting of a 50-foot monopole and equipment area, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 1901 Isabel Avenue, west side, south of Vineyard Avenue, Livermore area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 904-0008-001-02.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper
Moved to the Consent Calendar.

6. **VERIZON WIRELESS/SHEARER, PLN2010-00113** ~ Application to allow co-location of a Verizon cell site facility and to increase the monopole height from 50 to 66 feet to allow additional nine new panel antennas, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 1901 Isabel Avenue, west side, south of Vineyard Avenue, Livermore area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 904-0008-001-02.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper
Moved to the Consent Calendar.

7. **VERIZON WIRELESS/CHAVIS, CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT, PLN2010-00147**
~ Application to allow installation of nine 8-foot panel antennas, two dish antennas, equipment area and a screening element on an existing building, in an "A" (Agricultural) District, located at 707 Country Club Circle, south side, approximately 75 feet east of Castlewood Drive, Pleasanton area of unincorporated Alameda County, bearing Assessor's Parcel Number: 946-4386-001-20.
Staff Planner: Jeff Bonekemper
Moved to the Consent Calendar.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES - September 16 and October 14, 2010. *Member Harvey made the motion to approve both September 16th and October 14th Minutes as submitted. Member Goff seconded and the motion carried unanimously, 3/0.*

STAFF COMMENTS & CORRESPONDENCE - *Staff discussed the December meeting dates and the Board opted for December 9th.*

CHAIR'S REPORT: *None*

BOARD ANNOUNCEMENTS, COMMENTS AND REPORTS: *None*

ADJOURNMENT: *There being no further business, the hearing was adjourned at 1:50 p.m.*

ALBERT LOPEZ - SECRETARY
EAST COUNTY BOARD OF ZONING ADJUSTMENTS